HQA Lecture 19

The hydrodynamic corral

# The fluid corral experiments

• corral depth of 6mm, radius 1-3cm; driving frequency 40-70Hz



Droplet can only walk in the deep central region, thus remains confined within the "corral"

# Faraday wave modes in a circular corral



• different modes selected at different driving frequencies

# **Circular Faraday modes**

$$m = 1 \qquad m = 2 \qquad m = 3 \qquad m = 4 \qquad m = 5$$

$$(\nabla^{2} + k^{2}) h = 0$$

$$= J_{l}(k_{l,m}r) \sin(l\theta + \phi)$$
Benjamin and Ursell (1954)
$$\prod_{l=1}^{N} \prod_{l=1}^{N} \prod_{$$

 $\sim$ 

Faraday wave mode observed above threshold is determined by **forcing frequency** and **boundary conditions** 

 $h_{l,m}$ 

## **Small corrals**

• walls play role of confining central force; periodic/quasiperiodic orbits prevalent



## **Small corrals**

## **R** = 10.1 mm

• walls play role of confining central force; periodic orbits prevalent



# **Small corrals**

• walls play role of confining central force; periodic orbits prevalent



$$\gamma/\gamma_F = 0.95$$

#### **Small corrals at high Me**



• dynamical behavior reminiscent of that of a walker in a SHO

## **Small corrals at high Me**



# **Small corrals at high Me** $\gamma/\gamma_F = 0.95$

• intermittent switching between a number of accessible periodic orbits



• statistical behavior reminiscent of that of a walker in a SHO

#### Walkers in a larger circular corral



R = 20.2 mm

• the droplet excites and explores the resonant wave field of the cavity

## **Influence of memory**

## **R = 20.2 mm**

**Increased forcing amplitude** 



• walker motion becomes progressively more irregular with memory

## A droplet walking in a circular corral



• the droplet generates and explores its wave field

#### A droplet surfing in a circular corral

- strobe at the wave (and bouncing) frequency, 70 Hz
- fast bouncing dynamics filtered out



• drop appears to surf along the surface, guided by its pilot wave



# The quantum corral

Crommie, Lutz & Eigler (1993) Fiete & Heller (2003)

• de Broglie waves evident in the pdf of a sea of electrons trapped on a metal surface, excited by an SEM



# **Selected Faraday mode**



$$m = 5, l = 0$$

#### Most unstable mode above the Faraday threshold at f = 70 Hz

#### **Droplet walking in a circular corral**



### **Probability density function**



Harris, Moukhtar, Fort, Couder & Bush (PRE, 2013)

- coherent, wave-like statistics emerge from chaotic pilot-wave dynamics
- emergent statistics not inconsistent with the notion of particle trajectories



- max in surface perturbation amplitude correspond to peaks in pdf
- pdf prescribed by amplitude of the most unstable resonant wave mode of the cavity

# Emerging physical picture: 3 time scales

• **fast** dynamics: bouncing at resonance creates monochromatic wave field

 intermediate (strobed) pilot-wave dynamics: droplet rides its instantaneous guiding wave

• **long-term statistical** behaviour described by Faraday wave modes







# Analogy with quantum corrals



Crommie, Lutz, & Eigler, Science (1993)

Harris et al., PRE

- in quantum corral, electron statistics prescribed by the solution to the timeindependent Schrodinger equation in circular geometry with **de Broglie** wavelength
- in fluid corral, walker statistics are defined by the solution to wave equation in circular geometry with **Faraday** wavelength
- statistics prescribed by Born rule in QM, not in the hydrodynamic system

## **Quantum particles**

# **Bouncing droplets**

#### **Statistical description**



#### Fiete & Heller (2003)

#### **Statistical description**



Harris et al. (2012)

#### **Underlying dynamics**

**An Exposed Variable Theory** 

## **Quantum particles**

# **Bouncing droplets**

# Statistical description



Fiete & Heller (2003)

#### **Statistical description**



Harris et al. (2012)

**Underlying dynamics** 

**Hidden Variable Theory** 

**Underlying dynamics** 

**An Exposed Variable Theory** 

**Elliptical corral** 





Path length:  $P_L = 2a = 28.5 \,\mathrm{mm}$ 

Eccentricity: 
$$e = \frac{c}{a} = 0.5$$

#### Faraday Waves: Oscillation of an elliptic membrane

E. Mathieu, "Le mouvement vibratoire d'une membrane de forme elliptique," J. Math. Pures Appl. 13, 137–203 (1868).

#### **Two-dimensional Helmholtz equation:**

$$\frac{\partial^2 U}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2 U}{\partial y^2} + k^2 U = 0$$

Transform to elliptic coordinates and seek solutions of the form:

$$\bullet \qquad U(\xi,\eta) = R(\xi)\Phi(\eta)$$

Angular and radial Mathieu equations:

# Waves modes

#### Experiments





Theory

# Waves modes



# Wave forms arising at high Me





# Instantaneous pilot-wave field



- at any given instant, the pilot-wave differs from the most unstable cavity modes
- but vestiges of the cavity modes may be apparent

### The elliptical corral

Trajectories

Mean speed



• correlation between position and speed, as in the circular corral

- Sáenz, Cristea-Platon & Bush, Nat. Phys. (2018)

# **Elliptical corral - Probability density function**



# **Elliptical corral - Probability density function**



- $f = 72 \,\mathrm{Hz} \qquad \gamma/\gamma_F = 99.8\%$
- $h = 6 \,\mathrm{mm}$   $D = 0.696 \,\mathrm{mm}$

 $h_1 = 0.1 \,\mathrm{mm}$ 



#### $3\,\mathrm{h}\times20\,\mathrm{fps}\rightarrow36,000\,\mathrm{points}$





Theoretical eigenmode

Faraday waves

Walker's histogram

## **Mode superposition**

 $f = 72 \,\mathrm{Hz}$ 

#### Particle's histogram



- emergent statistics do *not* correspond to the most unstable Faraday mode at 72 Hz
- drop introduces a second mode that is the most unstable Faraday mode at 70 Hz

#### **Mode superposition**



#### A superposition of statistical states

### A new diagnostic: mean velocity

#### **Position histogram (pdf)**

## Mean speed and velocity



- while the mean velocity is zero in a circular corral, a quadrupolar flow emerges in the ellipse
- relation to Bohmian mechanics?

#### Fiete & Heller (2002)

#### **Projection effects: the `quantum mirage'**



- placing an impurity at one focus results in a `mirage' at the other focus
- effect pronounced in differential conductivity, as depends strongly on pdf

#### **Topographic control of walker statistics**

• in shallow-water limit, h = 1.7mm, the walker feels the bottom topography



- the walker is generally attracted to the well
- arbitrary placement of well simply disrupts coherence of pdf

#### Well at midpoint of semi-minor axis

#### Cavity mode



Mean wave field



 PDF
 220

 180
 140

 100 ≥
 60

 20
 20

#### Mean velocity



• well is not projected: acts to disrupt *pdf*, which is relatively incoherent
#### Well at left focus

#### Cavity mode



## Mean wave field



**PDF** 220 180 140 100 ≥ 60 20



- by preferentially selecting (4,4) mode, well is projected towards empty focus
- effect on pdf *more* pronounced than in quantum corral (Eric Heller)

#### An analog of the `quantum mirage'



• a hole at one focus induces a mirage at the other by favoring one cavity mode

## A striking equivalence



A superposition of statistical states

### The mean pilot-wave field



#### FOR PERIODIC OR CHAOTIC TRAJECTORIES



- the average wave field,  $\bar{\eta}(\mathbf{x})$ , corresponds to the convolution of the *pdf*,  $\mu(\mathbf{x})$ , and the wave field of a stationary bouncing droplet,  $\eta_B(\mathbf{x})$
- result deduced from the stroboscopic assumption, which breaks down at high Me

## The mean pilot-wave field of a circular orbit

We consider a drop in a circular orbit of radius  $r_0$  with constant speed. Its mean wavefield may be computed analytically in polar coordinates

$$\eta_B = A_B J_0(|\mathbf{x}|) \quad \text{and} \quad \mu(\mathbf{y}) = \delta(|\mathbf{y}|)/(2\pi r_0)$$

$$\bar{\eta}(\mathbf{x}) = \int_{\mathcal{R}^2} \eta_B(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{y})\mu(\mathbf{y}) \, \mathrm{d}\mathbf{y}$$

$$= A_B \int_{\mathcal{R}^2} \frac{J_0(\sqrt{r^2 + \rho^2 - 2r\rho\cos(\theta)})\delta(\rho - r_0)}{2\pi r_0}\rho \, \mathrm{d}\rho \, \mathrm{d}\theta$$

$$\boxed{\bar{\eta}(r) = A_B J_0(r_0) J_0(r)}$$

The mean wavefield has the form of a Bessel function centered on the orbital center, and an amplitude prescribed by the orbital radius.

### **The convolution result:** relates waveforms to trajectories





- prevalence of orbits with radii at zeros of  $J_0(r)$  suggests dominance of wave energy
- suggests that wave modes have corresponding periodic trajectories

### **Quantum particles**

Fiete & Heller (2003)





• superposition of wave modes

## **Bouncing droplets**





• superposition of subtrajectoriess

**Observation** (from both experiments and simulations)

• when walker motion is confined by boundaries or applied forces, the instantaneous pilot wave approaches the mean wave field at high Me *e.g.* simulated 1D pilot-wave dynamics in a simple harmonic potential



Durey, Milewski & Bush (2018)



## The mean pilot-wave field



## Mechanism for the coherent emergent statistics at hight Me?



- two possible mechanisms have been proposed
- based on the 2 existing HQA paradigms
- their shortcomings have prompted the development of Paradigm III

## **Paradigm I: orbital suggested by dynamics**



- at low memory, circular orbits along extrema of cavity mode are stable
- at higher memory, these orbits destabilize, yield to chaotic pilot-wave dynamics
- intermittent switching between periodic states results in multimodal statistics

*Harris et al.* (2013)

## **Paradigm II: Friedel oscillations from the outer boundaries**



- in-line oscillations with  $\lambda_F$  excited at corral's edge
- preferred reflection angle of  $\theta_R = 60^0$  gives rise to statistical signature with wavelength

$$\lambda_F \cos \pi/3 = \lambda_F/2$$



## **Paradigm II: Friedel oscillations from the outer boundaries**



- in-line oscillations with  $\lambda_F$  excited at corral's edge
- preferred reflection angle of  $\theta_R = 60^0$  gives rise to statistical signature with wavelength

$$\lambda_F \cos \pi/3 = \lambda_F/2$$



**Trajectory Equation in the high memory limit** 

$$m \ddot{\mathbf{x}}_{\mathbf{p}} = -D \dot{\mathbf{x}}_{\mathbf{p}} + \nabla \eta(\mathbf{x}, t) - \nabla V$$

• decompose wave force into mean and perturbation components

$$\nabla \eta(\mathbf{x},t) = \nabla \overline{\eta}(\mathbf{x}) + \nabla \eta^*(\mathbf{x},t)$$

• view the perturbation pilot-wave field as a stochastic forcing

### **Langevin-type Equation**

STOCHASTIC TERM

$$m\ddot{\mathbf{x}}_{\mathbf{p}} = -D\dot{\mathbf{x}}_{\mathbf{p}} + \nabla \bar{\eta}(\mathbf{x}) + \nabla \eta^*(\mathbf{x},t) - \nabla V$$

- mean wave field plays the role of an imposed potential, and is related to the pdf through the convolution relation  $\bar{\eta}(\mathbf{x}) = \eta_B * \mu(\mathbf{x})$
- the statistics appear to be driving the dynamics...

What relation does this physical picture have to quantum mechanics?

## The (Old) Hydrodynamic Interpretation of Quantum Mechanics

Schrodinger:  

$$i\hbar \Psi_t = -\frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \nabla^2 \Psi + V \Psi$$
  
Madelung transformation (1928):  
 $\Psi = \sqrt{\rho} e^{iS/\hbar}$   
Continuity:  
 $\frac{D\rho}{Dt} + \rho \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} = 0$   
Quantum  
Hamilton-Jacobi:  
 $\frac{\partial S}{\partial t} + \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{u}^2 - \frac{\hbar^2}{2m^2} \frac{1}{\sqrt{\rho}} \nabla^2 \sqrt{\rho} + \frac{V}{m} = 0$   
OUNTUM FORMULA O  
where  $\rho = |\Psi|^2$  is the probability density,  $S$  is the action,  
 $\mathbf{u} = \nabla S/m$  is the quantum velocity of probability,  
 $\mathbf{j} = \rho \mathbf{u}$  is the quantum probability flux.

## **Bohmian Mechanics (1952)**

- equate quantum velocity of probability  $\mathbf{u}$  and particle velocity  $\dot{\mathbf{x}}_p$
- solve Schrodinger's equation for  $\Psi$  , from which Q is computed
- solve trajectory equation

- quantum potential is nonlocal, imposed by fiat
- requires  $|\Psi|^2$  distribution as initial conditions in order for results to be equivalent to those of standard QM (Keller 1966); e.g. in corral

#### **Extensions** (Bohm & Vigier 1954)

• invoke a stochastic forcing  $\nabla \Phi_S$  from a `sub quantum realm':

$$m \ddot{\mathbf{x}}_p = -\nabla Q - \nabla V + \nabla \Phi_S$$

 $m \ddot{\mathbf{x}}_p = -\nabla Q - \nabla V$ 

• particles jostle about **u** like Brownian motion of gas molecules about streamlines



David Bohm

	<b>Bohmian mechanics</b>	Walkers
WAVELENGTH	$\lambda_B$	$\lambda_F$
GUIDANCE	$m \ddot{\mathbf{x}}_p = -\nabla Q - \nabla V + \nabla \Phi_S$	$m \ddot{\mathbf{x}}_{\mathbf{p}} = -D \dot{\mathbf{x}}_{\mathbf{p}} + \nabla \eta(\mathbf{x}, t) - \nabla V$
WAVE POTENTIAL	${f Q}=-rac{\hbar^2}{m^2}rac{1}{\sqrt{ ho}} abla^2\sqrt{ ho}$ quantum potential	$ar{\eta}(\mathbf{x}) \ = \ \eta_B st \mu(\mathbf{x})$ Mean wave field
STOCHASTIC FORCING	$ abla \Phi_S$ ARBITRARY, ad hoc	$- abla \eta^*(\mathbf{x},t)$ perturbation wave field
WAVE ORIGIN	NONE	PARTICLE VIBRATION

### This is NOT Bohmian mechanics!

Particle's histogram

`Bohmian' pilot wave = time-averaged pilot wave



- Bohm: predictions are consistent if you choose ICs appropriately
- Joe Keller: "A self-consistent theory need not impose prescribed ICs."
- Bohm: ``You can never have a pure cavity mode".



Time-dependent pilot-wave

#### This is NOT Bohmian mechanics, but...

• can we formulate a Bohmian mechanics to describe the mean velocity?





**`Bohmian' pilot wave = time-averaged pilot wave** 

Time-dependent pilot-wave





Particle's histogram

#### Walkers suggest a means of revising Bohmian mechanics

- consider high-frequency particle vibrations as the source of pilot wave
- the mean-pilot-wave field is related to the emergent statistical waveform (analog of Q)
- the instantaneous pilot wave differs owing to the disturbance induced by particle

#### Cavity mode



Instantaneous pilot wave







## de Broglie's pilot-wave theory: The double-wave solution

" A freely moving body follows a trajectory that is orthogonal to the surfaces of an associated wave guide".

- Louis de Broglie (1892-1987)

- $\Psi$  is the probability wave, as prescribed by standard quantum theory
- $\Psi^{dB} = |\Psi^{dB}| e^{i\phi/\hbar}$  is a real physical wave responsible for guiding the particle
- wave generated by internal particle vibration (*Zitterbewegung*) at the Compton frequency:
- a solution of Klein-Gordon equation triggered by oscillations in rest mass
- particle pushed perpendicular to surfaces of constant phase:

 $\mathbf{p} = m \dot{\mathbf{x}}_{\mathbf{p}} = \nabla \phi = \hbar \mathbf{k}$  for a monochromatic wave  $\Psi^{dB} = |\Psi^{dB}| e^{i(\mathbf{k} \cdot \mathbf{x} - \omega t)}$ 

- Harmony of Phases: the particle oscillates in resonance with its guiding wave
- $\Psi^{dB}$  differs from  $\Psi$  owing to nonlinearity in the vicinity of the particle







## de Broglie's pilot-wave theory

- fast dynamics: mass oscillations at  $\omega_c = \frac{m_0 c^2}{\hbar} \quad \text{create wave field}$ centered on particle
- intermediate pilot-wave dynamics: particle rides its guiding wave field

 $\mathbf{p} = \hbar \mathbf{k}$ 



• long-term statistical behaviour described by wave function of standard quantum theory







**Subsequent work on corrals** 

— unpublished experiments

#### Later work ... Wave mode analysis



Figure A-26: Azimuthally symmetric instantaneous wave field when the droplet is exploring the circular corral of diameter D = 28.5 mm, vibrated vertically at f = 70 Hz. a Instantaneous wave field displaying the dominantly described by one azimuthally symmetric mode. Overlaid in white is an example of the walker trajectory (of duration  $\sim 1$  s). b The weights of the five most prominent modes present in the reconstruction of the mean wave field.

#### Wave mode analysis



Figure A-25: Instantaneous wave field when the droplet is exploring the circular corral of diameter D = 28.5 mm, vibrated vertically at f = 70 Hz. **a** An arbitrary selected instantaneous wave field. Overlaid in white is an example of the walker trajectory (of duration  $\sim 10$  s). **b** The weights of the five most dominant modes present in the reconstruction of an arbitrary selected instantaneous wave field.

#### Wave mode analysis



Figure A-27: Non-azimuthally symmetric instantaneous wave field when the droplet is exploring the circular corral of diameter D = 28.5 mm, vibrated vertically at f = 70 Hz. **a** Instantaneous wave field displaying the dominantly described by one non-azimuthally symmetric mode. Overlaid in white is an example of the walker trajectory (of duration ~ 1 s). **b** The weights of the five most prominent modes present in the reconstruction of the mean wave field.

Average speed map

180 min



# **Non-axisymmetric modes?**

- non-axisymmetry lost in long-term statistics, since waves mostly generated by the walker
- observed pdf represents azimuthally averaged wave amplitude
- or is the minimum on axis retained?







## Modes of the square corral



## Walker in a square corral





• the walker excites and explores the resonant wave field of the cavity

# **Stadium corral**



l = 1.5r

Faraday waves

0.6 0.4 0.2 y/R0 -0.2 -0.4 -0.6 -0.5 0.5 -1 0 x/R

Walker histogram

#### A droplet walking in a narrow rectangular corral









$$\bar{v} = 9.63 \ mm/s$$

$$\bar{v} = 6.75 \ mm/s$$

$$\bar{v} = 5.23 \ mm/s$$

$$\bar{v} = 5.23 \ mm/s$$




Observation 1: Exploration Length Increases with Speed





### **Theoretical modeling of the circular corral**

J. Fluid Mech. (2020), vol. 891, A3. (S) The Author(s), 2020. Published by Cambridge University Press doi:10.1017/jfm.2020.140 891 A3-1

### Faraday pilot-wave dynamics in a circular corral

Matthew Durey<sup>1,2,4</sup>, Paul A. Milewski<sup>1</sup> and Zhan Wang<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Mathematical Sciences, University of Bath, Bath BA2 7AY, UK
<sup>2</sup>Department of Mathematics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA 02139, USA
<sup>3</sup>Key Laboratory for Mechanics in Fluid Solid Coupling Systems, Institute of Mechanics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100190, PR China

- strobe-based model correctly captures low Me behavior
- fails to predict emergent statistical behavior arising at high Me

### **Stability of circular orbits**



### **Evolution of periodic orbits**

### **R = 10 mm**



## **Regime diagram: dependence on corral radius, memory**



### **Regime diagram: circular corral experiments**

### **R** = 12.125 mm



## **Theoretical modeling of the circular corral**

PHYSICAL REVIEW E 93, 042202 (2016)

#### Quantumlike statistics of deterministic wave-particle interactions in a circular cavity

Tristan Gilet

Microfluidics Lab, Department of Aerospace and Mechanics, University of Liège, B-4000 Liège, Belgium (Received 21 January 2016; published 5 April 2016)

• neglect inertia: first order dynamics

 decompose pilot-wave field into cavity modes

$$\mathbf{X}_{n+1} - \mathbf{X}_n = -\delta \sum_k W_{k,n} \nabla \Phi_k]_{\mathbf{X}_n}$$

TABLE I. Twelve dominant Neumann eigenmodes for a cavity of radius 14.3 mm filled with 20 cS oil and forced at 83 Hz.

Mode	$k,\ell$	$\Lambda_F$	μ	M	Mode	$k, \ell$	$\Lambda_F$	μ	M
(	2,6	0.31	0.999	738		9,3	0.33	0.983	60
0	0,7	0.32	0.998	460		18,1	0.34	0.974	39
	4,5	0.34	0.993	141	83	10,3	0.32	0.968	32
63	13,2	0.33	0,990	99	£3	12,2	0.34	0.962	26
	17,1	0.33	0.989	90	8	6,4	0.34	0.951	20
	7,4	0.32	0.987	77		5,5	0.32	0.933	15

## **Theoretical modeling of the circular corral**



• only model to capture emergent statistical behavior in the circular corral

# **Summary of theoretical modeling**

- stroboscopic models of Faria, Durey capture low Me behavior
- these models fail to capture chaotic dynamics arising at high Me
- they also fail to capture the coherent statistics arising at high Me
- only Gilet's model successfully models emergent high Me statistical behavior

## Why?

- stroboscopic models neglect non-resonant effects
- neglect of drop inertia makes drop more skittish, as do non resonance effects

# What's next?

# HQA Paradigm 3

## Conclusions

- in the high-memory limit, the mean-pilot-wave field plays the role of the quantum potential in Bohmian mechanics
  - the statistics appear to influence the dynamics
- the instantaneous wave field differs from the mean in a manner that depends on the system memory
  - one expects the relative magnitudes of the mean and perturbation fields to be an important parameter
- the hydrodynamic pilot-wave system suggests a means of resolving difficulties of Bohmian mechanics, by enriching the dynamics a la de Broglie

## **Future directions**

- consider relaxation to statistical steady state from an ensemble of ICs
- consideration of non-resonant effects will lead us to **Paradigm III** in HQA